* 1. Absence of similar projects

According to DT and the German Authority’s best knowledge and to public information, no similar project exists today in Europe.

* 1. Counterfactual scenario

DT did not consider an alternative project nor a clearly defined and sufficiently predictable alternative project in its internal decision-making process (point 29. of IPCEI Communication). Thus, **there is no counterfactual scenario**.

The company’s “business as usual” R&D and FID activities in the field of telecommunications in the past three years can be roughly described as follows:

* DT will continue to dedicate most of its R&D efforts to meet to maintain broadband lines and

As a result, the counterfactual scenario will have zero investments in people and plants in France related to the graphite anode opportunity. Carbone Savoie will simply continue to invest its current R&D budget in addressing its current markets (aluminum and specialty graphite). Without the State aid, Carbone Savoie will not be able to develop its knowhow to address the anode material.

* 1. Start date of the project

Carbone Savoie has submitted a demand for public funding to French public authorities on 2019/01/30. Carbone Savoie had not undertaken any R&D or FID activity in the scope of IPCEI on Batteries before this date. Carbone Savoie started its activities in the IPCEI on Batteries in February 2019. Thus, the incentive effect of the State aid under notification cannot be presumed to be null.

* 1. Increase in R&D and FID efforts

Over the period 2019-2025 the state aid on this project would allow an increase of R&D and FID efforts of Carbone Savoie from 13.6 M€ to 42.5 M€, as indicated in the table below.



***Table 17: Increase in R&D and FID efforts***